

# Ives: Piano Works, Vol. 3

## Three-Page Sonata, s. 89

### DESCRIPTION OF SOURCES

**S** Pencil sketch (ca. 1910-11) with some ink, on two 12-stave leaves; no general title (at end of p. 3 Ives writes “End of | ‘3 Page Sonata’ | Fini at Saranac L[ake, NY] | with Dave [Twichell] – Aug[?] ’05”).

p. [1] (f4769) mm. 1–15

p. [2] (f4770) mm. 16–46 & 77–88

p. [3] (f4771) mm. 47–76 & 89–106

**p<sup>1</sup>** Pencil patch, on *Orchestral Set No. 3*, 1<sup>st</sup> movement score-sketch  
mm. (f1788) m. 1/22.♯

**p<sup>2</sup>** Pencil patch, on *Orchestral Set No. 3*, 1<sup>st</sup> movement score-sketch  
mm. (f4772) mm. 5–7/2.♯ and m. 8

**P** Published edition (Mercury, 1949), edited by Henry Cowell. (In his edition [Mercury, 1975], John Kirkpatrick writes that Cowell’s edition “was probably based on a set of 3 positives from [Ives Papers Photostat numbers] Q1770–72 which seem to have been in Cowell’s possession. They contain no fresh pencilings (beyond title and the number ‘99a’ in the Quality list of negatives, suggesting that Ives’s eyesight at that time was not up to clarifying details, and that Cowell was on his own in deciphering the often vague notation...” (see notes below for m. 12 and 18/3–4.♯).

p. 1 (f4773) pencil memo: “Mostly made as a joke to knock | the mollycoddles out of their boxes!  
| (from slip pinned on old MSS)”

### CRITICAL COMMENTARY

This edition is based on Ives’s pencil score (**S**).

1: **S** has crossed-out “Allegro”, replaced by “Allegro moderato” (as here).

1, 16.♯, RH/upstem: **S** had sixteenth–sixteenth–eighth, but sixteenth beaming is partially erased, emphasis added to the full-beat eighth-note beam, and an emphatic “3” added above (here, triplet).

1, 19–22.♩, LH: **S** starts a new line at 19.♩, and the tie from the previous *g* suggests that the parallel fourths should continue into 22.♩ (not carried out here); **S** has memo: “for 1<sup>st</sup> [or “LH”?] see top p 2 | ink copy”.

1, 21.♩, RH/downstem: **S** has overfat notehead covering A space and G line (here, *g*<sup>1</sup>).

1, 22.♩/last sextuplet ♩, LH: **p**<sup>1</sup> has *f*[*h*]<sup>1</sup> and added *d*<sup>1</sup> ♩, with memo: “or 7” (all ignored here).

1, 28.♩/2.♩, LH: **S** has *c*<sup>1</sup>+*a*<sup>1</sup>+*c*<sup>2</sup> with neither beaming nor value dots, but the triad is placed between the upstem eighths (here, dotted eighth).

1, 37.♩/4.♩, LH: **S** has crossed-out *b* (omitted here).

1, 39.♩: At the repeat mark **S** has crossed-out memo: “back to I<sup>st</sup> | Theme – all | nice Sonatas must | have I<sup>st</sup> Theme”.

3: On **S** Ives revised his plan from a simple 2/4 to a super triplet in each hand (as here), drawing vertical connection lines to show realignments, but leaving the RH top notes as a beat triplet (here *b*<sup>1</sup>–*g*<sup>2</sup>–*g*<sup>b2</sup> are part of the super triplet).

4, 5.♩/2<sup>nd</sup> triplet ♩, LH: **S** has half notes with top pitch *a*<sup>b1</sup> changed to dotted quarter (here, all pitches changed to dotted quarter).

4, 9.♩/1.♩, LH: **S** lacks value notes (supplied here).

4, 9.♩/2.♩, RH: **S** has mostly erased *f*<sup>#2</sup> (omitted here).

4, 13–14.♩, LH/upstem: **S** has erasure of original idea, leaving *f*<sup>#1</sup>–*g*<sup>1</sup> sixteenths floating (as here), and a vestigial “3” (omitted here) in the middle of the staff.

4, 14.♩/1.♩, RH/upstem: **S** has double-dotting on *b*<sup>b2</sup> (here, single).

4, 14.♩/1.♩, RH/downstem: **S** has notehead high in the A space, touching the B line (here, *b*<sup>1</sup>).

4, 14.  $\downarrow$ , LH: **S** has dotted quarter (here, value dots omitted to help resolve alignment issues).

5: **S** has tempo heading crossed out (retained here).

5–6, LH: **p**<sup>2</sup> has downstem half note on first three *G*s, with “8va Basso” beneath m. 5, 1<sup>st</sup> beat.

5–7/2<sup>nd</sup> triplet  $\downarrow$ , RH: **p**<sup>2</sup> has these pitches stretched out over 4 bars (not used here) above the same **S** baseline.

8, 1.  $\downarrow$ , RH: **S** has grace notes ( $f^2+a^2$ ) tied to half notes on the beat (omitted here to match the parallel treatment on 2<sup>nd</sup>–5<sup>th</sup> beats).

8, 2–5.  $\downarrow$ , RH: **S** has vague notation of the grace notes, appearing more like  $g^2+a^2$  (here, all matched to 1.  $\downarrow$  each of mm. 8 & 9).

9, 1.  $\downarrow$ , RH: **S** has additional but crossed-out grace note  $d^2$  (omitted here).

11, 1.  $\downarrow$ , RH: **S** lacks value dots (supplied here).

11, 2.  $\downarrow$ , LH: **S** has this beat crowded close to 1.  $\downarrow$  (here, realigned as 2<sup>nd</sup> beat).

11, 7.  $\downarrow$ , RH: **S** has mostly erased  $e^2$  (omitted here).

12, LH: **S** has only 1<sup>st</sup>  $d$  as  $\sharp$  (as here); **P** has each  $d$  as  $\natural$  (a change that Kirkpatrick speculates is from Ives).

12, 5.  $\downarrow$ , RH: **S** appears to have a value dot after 1.  $\downarrow$   $f^3$  but no flag for putative sixteenth (here, even eighths).

13, 3.  $\downarrow$ , RH: **S** lacks value dot (supplied here).

13, 4.  $\downarrow$ , RH: **S** has  $\sharp$  floating between  $c^2$  &  $f^2$  (here, assigned to  $f^2$ ;  $\sharp$  for  $c^2$  made editorial).

14, 2.  $\downarrow$ , RH/upstem: **S** has  $e^3-d^3-c^3$  crossed out (here, retained).

14, 4.  $\downarrow$ , RH/downstem: **S** has half notes (here, quarters).

14, 4.♩/last triplet ♩, RH/upstem: **S** has something written above, possibly “top” (but the T’s crossing is missing), part of an area of revisions and crossings out.

15, 2.♩, RH: **S** has crossed-out quarter-note  $g^3$  (omitted here).

15, 4.♩, RH/upstem: **S** has half notes (here, quarters).

16–21, RH/upstems: **S** has arrows (omitted here) connecting the stream of top melodic notes and memo: “(→♩→♩) means top melody | (copy on 3 staves) | better to have another player or | bells or celesta top.” (For mm. 22–32 Ives abandoned the arrows and highlighted the top melody in ink.)

18, 3–4.♩, RH/upstems: **S** has erasure at 3.♩/1.♩ with a bolder  $c(\#)^3$  and upstem; **P** (and Kirkpatrick in Mercury 1975) assume this to be a quarter note superceding the 3.♩/2.♩  $c\sharp^2$  (as this possible change by Ives is not clear, here the literal condition of **S** is retained).

21: At end of bar (= end of system) **S** has memo: “to [symbol]” (apparently referring to a now-missing patch; see following note).

22: **S** has memo (for mm. 22–33: “(for Bells air see [symbol] ink sheet” (apparently referring to a now-missing patch; see previous note).

25, 1.♩, RH/downstem: **S** has sixteenth(tied)–sixteenth–eighth, breaking the pattern (here, repaired as dotted eighth–sixteenth).

27, 2.♩, RH/downstem: Ives’s pattern of 5♩s breaks down when **S** has sixteenth–eighth (possibly dotted; here, the intended dotted eighth–sixteenth).

28, 2.♩/2.♩, RH/downstem: **S** has this and the next chord indicated as a quarter–quarter duplet (here, written-out 5♩ rhythm).

30, 1.♩, LH: **S** has partially erased quarter-note downstem on 1.♩  $B$  (omitted here).

30, 4.♩/2.♩, RH/downstem: **S** has this and the next chord indicated as a quarter–quarter duplet (here, written-out 5♩ rhythm).

31, 3.♩, RH/downstem: **S** has this and the next chord indicated as a quarter–quarter duplet (here, written-out 5.♩ rhythm).

32, 2.♩, RH/downstem: **S** has this and the next chord as quarters each, without duplet marking (here, written-out 5.♩ rhythm).

33, 4.♩, RH/downstem: **S** has half note (here, quarter).

34: **S** has three crossed-out versions (omitted here) of this measure.

35: **S** has elaborate symbol also found at m. 76, and memos: “1<sup>st</sup> Time announced alone in octaves *ff* = as a Preface Declamation!” (i.e. notated RH is not to be used until the return at m. 77, as here) and “March time (but not a March – Rollo!)”.

36, LH, 2.♩: **S** has ^ accent (here, moved to 1.♩/4.♩).

37/79: **S** has memo: “octaves LH”.

40/82, 4.♩/1.♩: **S** lacks LH value dots (supplied here).

40/82, last ♩: **S** has bottom pitch squarely on G line (as here, but possibly intended as *F*).

45/87: **S** has its original 3<sup>rd</sup>–4<sup>th</sup> beats crossed out and replaced (as here).

47–49/89–91: **S** has these measures surrounded by repeat marks (omitted here) and the measures are numbered above RH “(1) (2) (3)” with memo in mm. 50–52 (where the measures are again numbered above RH “(1) (2) (3)”: “I play the 3 meas. before | over again but had | something | else | can’t | fin[d]” (thus, mm. 50–52 are to be a written out repeat of Ives’s mm. 47–49 RH with a new baseline, as here).

50/92, 3–6<sup>th</sup> triplet ♩: **S** has only LH upper octave, with memo below “octs octs” (here, octaves realized).

53: **S** has a symbol to which the end of m. 100 refers back (see note 101–105). Below staff (or above m. 60) **S** has memo: “(2<sup>nd</sup> player may join | (after bow to Ladies)”.

53/101, 2.♩, RH: **S** has value dots (omitted here), but an alignment line pairs the following eighth-note chord with mid bar of LH (requiring adjustment, as here).

55/103, 1<sup>st</sup> triplet ♩, RH: **S** appears to have a mostly erased ♯ for *d*<sup>1</sup> and # too high for the *e*<sup>1</sup> (ignored here).

55/103, 2<sup>nd</sup> triplet ♩, RH: **S** has notehead sitting high in C space, touching the D line (here,  $d^2$ ).

56/104, 1. ♩/6<sup>th</sup> triplet ♩, LH: **S** has notehead sitting low in C space, touching the B line (here,  $Bb$ ).

57/105, 1<sup>st</sup> triplet ♩, LH: **S** lacks value dotted (supplied here).

58, 4. ♩, RH: The noteheads for  $c^2+d^2$  (as here) sit only slightly higher in **S** than the previous eighth's  $b^1+c^2$ .

59/92, 66/99, & 75: **S** lacks closing barlines (generally due to crowding at the end of the systems; supplied here).

59/92, 1. ♩: **S** has sharp sign floating between the staves (possibly intended as key signature for bass clef?, omitted here).

59–63 & 92–96, LH: **S** labels blank mm. 59–60 “A” – “B”; blank mm. 61 is labeled “B” but notates last eighth  $Ab$  (as here); m. 62 is labeled “A” but fully notated; m. 63 is labeled “B” with a repeat-measure symbol.

60/93: For memo possibly related to here (or, more realistically, to m. 59), see note for m. 53.

66, 2. ♩, RH: **S** has faint  $ab^1$  (possibly erased; omitted here).

68–73, LH: **S** labels these blank measures “A” – “B” – “B” (with notated m. 70/last ♩  $Ab$ )– “A” – “A” – “B”.

71, 2. ♩, RH: **S** has crossed out tie forward (omitted here).

76: At the end of the measure **S** has memo: “to [symbol seen also at m. 35] | Now, class, we it is | right to return to | I<sup>st</sup> Theme in M[ovement?] III”.

77, 2. ♩/1. ♩, RH: **S** has notehead low in the F space, touching the E line (here,  $e^1$ ).

77, 2. ♩/2. ♩, RH: **S** has notehead high on the F line (here,  $f^{\sharp 2}$ ).

78, 1. ♩, RH: **S** has notehead low in F space, touching the E line (here,  $e^1$ ).

79, 1.♩, RH/upstem: **S** has notehead low in E space, touching the D line (exactly the same placement as the preceding D, m. 78/last ♩; here,  $d^2$ ).

81–82, RH: **S** has repeat-measure symbol in each bar, implying that m. 80's chord continue to alternate (as here).

92–100: At the end of m. 91 **S** has memo above RH staff: “on II<sup>nd</sup> time | repeat 2<sup>nd</sup> | Theme | (as is right! | correct | from  $\Theta$  to  $\Theta$ )” (referring to mm. 68–76 which are surrounded by these same symbols).

101–105: At the end of the m. 100 **S** has memo: “on II time | we return as | is usual to I<sup>st</sup> development | at [symbol]” (referring to mm. 53–57).

104: At the end of the measure **S** has memo above: “on 2<sup>nd</sup> | or Recap | to Coda [symbol] bottom!!” and crossed-out memo below: “on Recap | to Coda”; from each memo there is an arrow forward to a memo at the end of m. 105 (see note below). It seems apparent that Ives changed his mind about jumping from the end of m. 104 to 106, but here the memo “to Coda” is included as an option.

105: At the end of the measure (= m. 57) **S** has memo above: “to Coda” and memo below: “2<sup>nd</sup> Time | as recap | to Coda [symbol]” (referring to m. 106).

106: **S** has memo: “Doh! | CHORD | Right | TONICK! | Good | Nit[e] SHIRT.” Memo below: “End of | ‘3 Page Sonata’ | Fini at Saranac L[ake] | with Dave [Twichell]. | Aug[?] ’05”.

106, LH, 3.♩: **S** has half note (here, whole note).

## [Invention in D], S. 118

### DESCRIPTION OF SOURCES

**S** Pencil sketch (1896–98), on the outside front of a 16-stave double leaf (on whose other pages are the pencil sketches of various canonic exercises, S. 406–08, and a fragment, S. 523).

one page (f4768), complete in 41 mm. (calling for a “D.C.” [al Coda] yielding 58 mm.)

### CRITICAL COMMENTARY

1, meter: **S** has “3/4” overwritten by “3/8” (the latter, as here; the 1.♩ of RH replaces an erased half note).

9, 1.♩, RH/downstem: **S** has quarter note (here, eighth).

11, 3. ♪, RH: **S** has sixteenth rest (here, eighth).

18 & 35: In **S** Ives uses “§” for his coda sign (replaced here with the traditional symbol).

22, 1. ♪, RH: **S** has sharp (omitted here).

23, 1. ♪, RH/downstem: **S** has  $f^1$  as a quarter stemmed with LH (here, eighth beamed with the “alto” line).

23, last sixteenth, RH/upstem: **S** has notehead overlapping the F line and the G space (here,  $f(\#)^2$ ).

## [Set of Five Take-Offs], s. 122

### DESCRIPTION OF SOURCE

**S** Pencil sketch (ca. 1909), on three 12-stave leaves, only pp. [2]–[4] sequentially numbered, no general title; editorial title supplied by John Kirkpatrick.

p. [1] (f4774) mvt. [i], mm. 1–36 (complete) of “The Seen & Unseen?”

p. [2] (f4775) mvt. [ii], mm. 1–12 of “Rough & Ready” (page numbered and circled “1”; at bottom of page, upside down, is the pencil sketch for *Study No. 18: Sunrise Cadenza*, S. 102)

p. [3] (f4776) mvt. [ii], mm. 13–30(4. ♪) of “Rough & Ready” (page numbered and circled “2”)

p. [4] (f4777) mvt. [ii], mm. 30(5. ♪)–38 (end) of “Rough & Ready” (page numbered and circled “3”)

mvt. [iii], mm. 1–20(2. ♪) (all crossed out) of “Song without (Good) Words”

p. [5] (f4778) mvt. [iii], mm. 20(3. ♪)–29 (end) of “Song without (Good) Words”

mvt. [iv], mm. 1–12(2<sup>nd</sup> beat) of “Scene Episode”

p. [6] (f4779) mvt. [iv], mm. 12(3<sup>rd</sup> beat)–20 of “Scene Episode”

mvt. [v], mm. 1–9 (complete) of “Bad Resolutions & Good WAN!”

### CRITICAL COMMENTARY

In the sole source (**S**) Ives made numerous erasures and revisions. Here, the final results are presented. Some of the erasures are noted in the following commentary. Some small noteheads are used here to represent Ives’s tiny dots that may or may not be intentional noteheads.

**Mvt. i: The Seen and Unseen?** [Commentary for edited version]

1, 2. ♪, RH/upstem: **S** has crossed out  $g^2$  dotted half (omitted here).

2, 2.♩, RH/upstem: **S** has crossed out  $c^{\#3}+f^{\#3}+g^{\#3}$  dotted halves (omitted here).

3, 2.♩, RH/upstem: **S** has crossed out  $a^2+c^3$  dotted halves (omitted here).

4, 2.♩, RH/upstem: **S** has mostly erased  $e^3$  quarter (omitted here).

4, 3.♩, RH: **S** has crossed out  $eb^3$  half note (omitted here).

5, above RH staff: **S** has memo: “tune in black notes between ♩ — ♩ —  $f$  | other  $mf$  | or  $p$ ”.

5, between staves: **S** has  $mf$  and below that “ $m$ ” (Ives’s occasional shorthand for something less than  $mf$ ; here, rendered as “ $mf$  or  $mp$ ”).

6: **S** has “5” between staves (here, realized as 5/4 signature).

6, 1.♩, RH/downstem: **S** has ♩ (here, value dots added).

6, 1.♩, LH/downstem: **S** has circled and crossed out  $FF^{\#}+C^{\#}$  dotted whole notes (omitted here).

6, 6.♩, RH/upstem: **S** has crossed out  $f^3$  eighth-tied-to-half, marked both  $\#$  and  $b$  (omitted here); on a photostat given to John Kirkpatrick around 1938, Ives marked these tied notes “ $Gb$ ”.

7, 5.♩, RH/downstem: **S** has crossed out  $e^2$  quarter (omitted here).

7, 5.♩, LH/downstem: **S** has crossed out  $C^{\#}$  half, marked “?” (omitted here).

8, 3<sup>rd</sup> triplet ♩, RH/downstem: **S** has possibly  $c^{\#1}$  (as here) or  $d^{\#1}$  depending on how one reads the triplet bracket that may be crossing under or through the notehead.

9, 1.♩, LH: On **S** the  $e$  (as here) is faint (possibly partially erased).

10, 3<sup>rd</sup> triplet ♩, RH/downstem: **S** has ties forward (as here) mostly erased probably as the result of revision to the upstem line.

11, last triplet ♩, LH: **S** has notehead sitting barely higher than previous *a* (here, *b*).

12–15: **S** has m. 12 marked “a” and m. 13 marked “b”; m. 14 is marked “a” and m. 15 is marked “b” but the latter with a new chord on 2<sup>nd</sup> half (all as realized here).

19, 1. ♩, LH: *b* ♩ added editorially (for hand assignment).

19, 5. ♩, RH: **S** lacks value dots (supplied here).

21, 1. ♩, RH: **S** has mostly erased # sign before  $f^2$  (# included here because it is expected in the transposition from m. 20).

21, 1. ♩, LH: **S** has crossed out *f* half note (omitted here).

21, 3. ♩/last ♩, RH: **S** has natural sign for  $c^3$  altered to a sharp (as here).

23: **S** has a mostly erased and crossed out memo between staves at the beginning of the bar that appears to read “to Coda”; under 4. ♩ (end of line) likewise mostly erased: “see  $\Theta$ ” (this latter sign not found elsewhere in this source).

23, 5. ♩/2. ♩, RH: **S** has # unclearly placed near  $f^1$  &  $g^1$  (here, # for  $g^1$ ).

23, 6. ♩/2. ♩, RH: **S** has crossed out what may have been  $f^1+a^1$ , replaced by  $e^1+g^1$  (as here).

23, 7. ♩/2. ♩, RH: **S** has a faint flat for *b* (retained here).

24, 1. ♩, LH: **S** has *b+d* (crossed out, a vestige of Ives’s starting to write the chord in bass clef before deciding to notate in treble clef).

24: Following m. 24 **S** has one measure of crossed out material (omitted here).

5a–11a: **S** is marked for a return to mm. 5–11 (as realized here).

25: For the end of the reappearance of mm. 5–11 **S** has a C major chord, but an arrow to a notated ending (mm. 25a–27, as used here).

25a, 3. ♩: **S** has G major half-note chord (crossed out in its RH only, omitted here), followed by an F major quarter-note chord (crossed out in its LH only, omitted here), followed by the chord used in this edition. **S**

has the notehead for  $g^1$  (as here) sitting so high that it could be interpreted as  $a^1$ . The LH chord lacks value dots (supplied here).

34(last )—36: The effect here is of chords/notes release separately: first LH/downstem, then LH/upstem, and finally the  $a^1$ .

**Mvt. ii: Rough and Ready et al.** [Commentary for edited version]

1: **S** has “Modo.” (here, “Moderato”). **S** has title as “‘Rough & Ready’ et al.’ | and | or the Jumping Frog ‘Frog’ part played | by the thumb — is the | Frog!”.

6, 1. /2. , RH: **S** has mostly erased sharp sign (omitted here).

6, 1. /4. , LH: **S** has notehead sitting low in the G space (here,  $f$ ).

6, 4. /1. , RH: **S** has crossed out  $d^{\flat 2}$  (omitted here).

7, 4. /1. , RH: **S** has  $c^{\sharp 3}$  crossed out (but retained here).

8, 1. /4<sup>th</sup> quintuplet , LH: **S** has mostly erased  $e$  (omitted here), replaced by  $c$  (as here).

10, 1. /1<sup>st</sup> quintuplet , LH: **S** has mostly erased  $e^{\sharp}$  (omitted here), replaced by  $g^{\flat}$  (as here).

10, 2. /1. , RH: **S** has mostly erased quarter notehead  $d^3$  (omitted here).

18, 1. /2<sup>nd</sup> quintuplet , LH: **S** has mostly erased notehead  $F^{\sharp}$  (omitted here) just after the 2<sup>nd</sup> quintuplet  (A).

21: **S** has two quarter beats of music crossed out (omitted here) leaving the one beat of music (as here).

22: **S** has memo between staves: “2<sup>nd</sup> asst. V.P. [Vice President?] if not playing LH. Part before may join in here.”

22, 2. /6<sup>th</sup> septuplet , LH: **S** has a possibly partially erased  $F$  (retained here, making its labeled sextuplet a septuplet, as editorially altered here).

22, 3. /penultimate sextuplet thirty-second, LH: **S** has a partially erased  $\sharp$  (retained here) for  $f$ .

22, 3. /last two sextuplet , LH: **S** has extra beam (omitted here) appearing to call for thirty-second note rhythm.

23, 4. /last sextuplet , LH: **S** has notehead sitting high on ledger line (here,  $c^1$ ).

24–25: On **S** these measures are under the first ending marking, followed by a repeat sign that refers back to m. 22 (here, the repeated measures [mm. 22–23] are written out as mm. 26–27).

25, 3. /after 1<sup>st</sup> sextuplet , LH: **S** has mostly erased notehead  $F^{\flat}$  (tied forward; omitted here).

25, 4. /2<sup>nd</sup> triplet /3<sup>rd</sup> thirty-second, LH: **S** has notehead sitting high on A line (here,  $a$ ).

26–27: **S** has only the bass line/downstem notes, with memo: “This | (2 – 4/4 measures) | really not a repeat, but to be copied out | also in copying all notes with no sign = ( $\flat$ )”.

28: **S** labels this “**II**” (second ending).

28, 2<sup>nd</sup> sextuplet , LH: **S** has mostly erased  $d$  (omitted here).

29, 1. /2<sup>nd</sup> quintuplet , RH: **S** has crossed out  $e^1+g^1$  (omitted here).

29, 4. /1<sup>st</sup> quintuplet , RH: **S** has mostly erased flat sign (omitted here) on  $b^1$ .

30, 5. : **S** has memo: “(The  of the [4 ] =  of the preceding [~~5 ~~ or of the [6 ])” (as here, with crossed out material omitted).

30, 8. /1. , RH: **S** has notehead very low in A space, crowding with a quarter  $g^1$  (here, simultaneous  $g^1$ ).

30, 8. /3. , LH: **S** has notehead sitting high on G line/low in A space (here,  $G$ ).

31, 1. /4. , LH: **S** has crossed out  $d$  (omitted here).

31, 3. /2. , LH: **S** has  $f^{\flat}$  with memo: “ $E^{\flat}$ ” (here,  $e$ ).

32, 4. , LH: **S** has notehead sitting low in G space (here,  $g^\sharp$ ).

32, 4. , LH: **S** has notehead sitting low in A space preceded by what appears to be a  $\sharp$  (here,  $A^\sharp$ ).

33, 5. , LH/upstem: **S** lacks value dot (supplied here).

34, 2. , RH: **S** has crossed out  $bb^2$  (omitted here).

35, 1. , upstem: **S** lacks value dot (supplied here).

35, 2. , RH: **S** has crossed out  $a^2$  (omitted here).

35, 3. , RH: **S** has a faint tie forward (omitted here).

35, last , RH/downstem: **S** has mostly erased tie forward (omitted here).

37, 3. , RH/upstem: **S** has flat sitting in G space or low for A ledger (here,  $ab^2$ ).

37, 4. –– thirty-seconds, LH/upstem: **S** also has small noteheads  $a$ – $a$  (omitted here) that appear to be supplanted by the  $g^\sharp$ – $f$  (as here).

37, 4. –– thirty-second, LH/upstem: **S** also has small notehead  $f$  (omitted here) that appears to be supplanted by the  $g$  (as here).

37, 5.  quintuplet , LH/upstems: Ives layered revisions here (all crossed out); **S** also has  $EE+c$ – $d$ – $f$ – $c$  (omitted here); the pitches retained here are editorial choices.

38, 2–4. , LH: **S** has repeat-figure symbols (here, written out from 1. 's figure).

38, 3–4. , RH: **S** has crossed out “8va” marking (retained here with Ives’s cross out).

38, 6. –––––––––––––––––––––––––––––––

### Mvt. iii: Song without (Good) Words

- 1, RH: **S** has one flat as a key signature, but thereafter the other systems do not carry it forward.
- 2, RH: **S** has repeat-measure symbol (here, written out from m. 1).
- 5: After m. 5 **S** has a measure of crossed out material. (omitted here).
- 6, 2. ♩, RH: Ives has revised here without it being apparent what changes are final; 2<sup>nd</sup> quarter (dotted)  $e^1$  is circled (possibly the circle is a half note, omitted here).
- 7, 1. ♩, RH/downstem: **S** has whole note  $bb+d^1$  (here, dotted half).
- 7, 3. ♩/2. ♩, RH/upstem: **S** has notehead sitting low in C space, touching the B line (here,  $c^2$ ).
- 8, 1. ♩, RH/downstem: **S** has half note  $d^1+f^1$  (here, quarter).
- 8, 1. ♩, LH: In addition to the  $db$  half note, **S** has  $db$  eighth (here, rendered as eighth rest).
- 9, 1. ♩: **S** lacks value dots (supplied here).
- 10 LH: **S** has whole note  $a$  (omitted here).
- 12: **S** has its 3–4. ♩ material crossed out (omitted here), with arrow directing from 4. ♩ to m. 13, 1. ♩.
- 13, 3. ♩, RH/downstem: **S** appears to lack a value dot (supplied here) for  $f\#^1$ .
- 14, 1. ♩, RH/upstem: **S** lacks value dot (supplied here).
- 14, 3. ♩, RH: **S** has uncertain alignment and durations (here,  $f^2+a^2$  placed on beat as eighth).
- 15, 2. ♩, RH/upstem: **S** has eighth-note flag on  $f\#^2$  (here, quarter note).
- 16–17: **S** has crossed out material of m. 16/3–4. ♩ and m. 17/1–2. ♩ (here, only the unrejected material is retained).

18: **S** has its first attempt at this measure crossed out, but followed by a rewrite at top of its next page (as used here).

19, 1.♩, RH/upstem: **S** has a value dot (omitted here) for  $d^2$  half note.

20, 2.♩, RH: **S** has erasures of  $d^1 + d^2$  noteheads and a 2.♩  $c^{\#2}$  notehead (all omitted here).

20, 3.♩, RH: **S** has erasures of two noteheads  $a^2 - c^2$  (omitted here).

21, 2.♩, RH/downstem: **S** has crossed out  $f$  half note (omitted here).

21, 4.♩, RH/upstem: **S** appears to have value dot (omitted here).

21: At the end of this measure **S** has “to [symbol]” referring back to m. 3 (apparently a second thought, carried out here). **S** has a bar of scant material, all crossed out (omitted here).

22: **S** has “Coda” (but crossed out). After m. 22 **S** has a measure that ends with repeat-back barline and “~~D.C.~~” (but this measure—unused here—appears to be orphaned by a “to Coda” at the end of m. 22).

23, 3<sup>rd</sup> triplet ♩, RH/upstem: **S** has crossed out  $a^{\#1}$  (omitted here) that ties into m. 24.

24, 1.♩, RH: Given that Ives crossed out m. 23’s  $a^{\#1}$ , he may have intended to omit this tied-into  $a^{\#1}$  (here, in parentheses).

24, 3<sup>rd</sup> triplet ♩, LH: **S** has the two ledger lines below staff, only lacking the  $C$  (supplied here editorially).

25, LH: **S** has  $C$  with memo: “8va lower” (here,  $CC+C$  octave).

#### **Mvt. iv: Scene Episode**

1, 2.♩/1.♩, RH: **S** has notehead sitting high in  $D$  space, touching  $E$  line (here,  $e^1$ ).

1, 3.♩/2.♩, LH/downstem: **S** has quarter stem (here, eighth).

3, 4.♩, LH: **S** has the  $f^{\#}$  slightly more assured than the  $g$ .

3, 8.♩/3.♩, LH: **S** also has crossed out  $B^b$  (omitted here).

4, 3. ♪/1. ♪, RH/upstem: **S** lacks value dots (supplied here).

6, 1. ♪, RH: **S** lacks sixteenth flag on last chord (supplied here).

6, 2. ♪/1<sup>st</sup> & 3<sup>rd</sup> triplet ♪, RH: **S** has tiny dots of  $c^2$  (here, small noteheads).

7, 2. ♪/1. ♪, LH: **S** has small dot, possibly a  $b$  notehead (before deciding on  $g$ ;  $b$  omitted here).

8, 6. ♪, RH: **S** has notehead sitting low in the C space, touching the B line (here,  $b(b)^1$ ).

10: **S** has a false start (crossed out) and superseded (as used here); the rejected version's "Cantab." is retained here (as "Cantabile").

10, 4<sup>th</sup> dotted-quarter beat, LH/upstem: The mid-beat  $G^b$  chord (as here) is circled in **S** (possibly to isolate its meaning as a contrasting *pp* chord; sometimes such circling means for omission). The parallel chord in m. 11 is likewise circled.

10, last two ♪s, RH/downstem: Ives added sixteenth stemming (omitted here), possibly toward some revision at the end of this bar.

12: **S** has one quarter beat of crossed out material (omitted here) following the 1<sup>st</sup> dotted quarter.

15, 2. ♪., LH/downstems: **S** has this an octave higher, marked "8va lower" and below "8 - - - -" (realized here).

15, 2. ♪./2-3. ♪, RH/upstems: **S** has "octs" above  $d^{\#2}-c^{\#2}$  (realized here).

16, 6. ♪, LH: **S** has notehead sitting low in E space, touching D line (here,  $d^{\#}$ ).

17, 6. ♪, RH: **S** has a slight trail downward from the flat for  $g^2$  which might be a thought toward making it a natural.

17, last ♪, RH: **S** has tiny  $g^1$  notehead (omitted here) above the much bolder  $f^{\#1}$ .

18: **S** has one dotted quarter's worth of crossed out material (omitted here) following the present 6.♩ (the "rit." retained here is partly under the crossing out). This is followed by four measures of crossed out material (omitted here).

### **Mvt. v: Bad Resolutions & Good WAN!**

1, 2.♩, LH/upstem: **S** has an erased half note *g* (the 1.♩'s stem is mostly erased to render it a whole note, as here).

3, 1.♩/upstem each: **S** has RH changed from  $c^2$  to  $d^2$  (as here) and LH from *g* to *a* (as here).

6, 1.♩, LH: **S** has a mostly erased half note *d* (omitted here).

8: The "Good" in the title has arrow pointing to m. 8.

8, 3–4.♩, RH/downstem: **S** has this triplet notated on the bass clef (moved here to treble for ease of reading).

8, 3–4.♩, LH/downstem: **S** has this rising, accelerating line (in these double-value durations) crowded under about 6 sixteenths of the upstem notes (here, distributed according to the correct alignment for one half value of their durations).

8, last two ♩s, RH: **S** has these final G–F# pitches with just quarter note stemming (here, sixteenth-note octaves); the top and bottom octaves notehead are displaced enough to suggest that Ives may have been considering them as four thirty-seconds,  $g^1 - g^2 - f\#^1 - f\#^2$ .

9: The end of the date over this bar is partly lost by the deteriorating margin; it is clear that the last digit of the year has a horizontal stroke at its top (thus here a "7" is suggested editorially).

## **Varied Air and Variations, s. 124**

### **DESCRIPTION OF SOURCE**

**S** Pencil sketch (ca. 1923), on a mixed group of 12- and 16-stave single and double leaves, one double leaf having previously been used for sketches for *The Celestial Railroad*, S. 116.

p. [1] (f4864) mm. 1–5 (and their repetitions after mm. 33, 33a, 43, & 71); plus 8 mm. (= 1<sup>st</sup> version of mm. 26–33), 8 mm. (= 1<sup>st</sup> version of mm. 36–43), and 1 m. (labeled "Protest") [Source "A" for John Kirkpatrick's 1971 edition]

p. [2] (f4867) mm. 25–33 (and their repetition after m. 94); plus 2 bars containing only memos [JK: Source "B, p. 1"]

p. [3] (f4866) mm. 36–43 (and the repletion of mm. 41–43 after m. 33a); plus 20 mm. (= 1<sup>st</sup> version of 74–93) [JK: Source “B, p. 2”]  
p. [4] (f4865) mm. 64–71 [JK: Source “C, p. 1”]  
p. 4 [here, 5] (f4868) mm. 74–94; plus 1 m. (rej.) [JK: Source “C, p. 2”]  
p. [6] (f4869) mm. 96–98 (3 mm. sequenced by Ives’s connecting lines) [JK: Source “D”]

## CRITICAL COMMENTARY

In the sole source (**S**) Ives made numerous erasures and revisions. Here, the final results are presented. Some of the erasures are noted in the following commentary.

All of Ives’s accidentals are retained in this edition. In the RH margin of **S**, p. [2] Ives writes “usually all notes are ♯ unless other ‘ways’ marked”. Square-bracketed and curvy-bracketed accidentals are editorial.

The measure numbering of this edited version follows that of the source (which is numbered straight through regardless of the encoded reordering).

These following notes primarily address the edited version.

1–5: **S** has (above mm. 2–4) “Protests— | by a moan[er]” and (in LH margin) “First protest, | for ‘box belles’ | when ‘man’ | comes on stage” (here, editorially combined).

2, LH: **S** has repeat-measure signs (as realized here).

2–4, RH: **S** has repeat-measure signs (as realized here from m. 1).

3 & 4, LH: **S** has its m. 3 labeled “(4)” and its m. 4 labeled “(3)” along with an arrow pointing back from “(3)” to “(4)” (here, Ives’s directions are followed to swap these measures).

5, 1<sup>st</sup> quarter, LH: Swapping Ives’s mm. 3 & 4 (see previous note) requires replacing Ives’s  $e\sharp+d^1$  with tied-back  $f+e^1$  (as here).

25: **S** (p. [2]) has memo: “The old | stone wall | around the orchard’ | none of | these stones | eggsactly the same size”. **S**, p. [1] has “Allegro” (here, as in **S**, p. [2]).

25–33: **S** (p. [2]) has memos “First play ‘line’ of rocks alone in 3 oct apart” and “Follow the Stone wall | (ink notes) around the | mountain”, the lead “line” over-marked in ink for presentation (as here) alone; in mm. 25a–33a the complete texture is used.

1a: **S** (p. [2]) has memos (in urtext edn, mm. 34 & 35): “1<sup>st</sup> | time | to | 2<sup>nd</sup> Protest | moa[n]” and “2<sup>nd</sup> | time | to | [symbol (same symbol appears at m. 41, 3.♯)] | no | [fermata]”.

25a: **S** (p. [2]) has memo (above m. 27): “Possible for 2 hands on same man | Easier (or better?) [dittoed: for] 2 [dittoed: hands on] 2 men!”

25a–33a: **S** has memo (at m. 33): “The Stone wall (ink line) *ffffff* | and the other notes *ppppppp* | = things & sounds in the distance | seen heard | & seen | from the MT [i.e. mountain]”.

27a, 2.♯/3<sup>rd</sup> triplet ♯, middle staff: **S** has what appears to be a half note head  $b^1$  (omitted here).

29a: **S** has this on one RH staff (here, the lines are broken out onto the available two RH staves).

29a, 6.♩, RH: **S** has value dot (omitted here) on  $f^{\#2}$ .

33a, last ♩: **S** has memo: “hold | this ch[ord] | with Ped. | & strike 1<sup>st</sup> chord of | Protest before letting | up Ped” (here “Ped.” marking added in LH).

36: **S** (p. [3]) has memos in margin for RH “or | *ff* *f* | all | & or” and for LH “*pp* *p* | if 2 RH *pp* | LH *ff*”.

43, 4.♩/5<sup>th</sup> septuplet ♩, RH: **S** has  $e^2$  (as here in cue size) possibly superceded by  $g^{\#2}$  (as here in full size; it is not clear to which pitch Ives’s sharp applies), however, when Ives writes out this same passage on **S**, p. [4], he clearly notates an  $f^{\#2}$  (see urtext edn. m. 71, 4.♩/5<sup>th</sup> septuplet ♩).

43, last ♩: **S** has RH memos: “Otto’s – 4 RH | fingers | hit everything | from  $F^{\flat}$  to  $D^{\flat}$ ” and “(top hold  $C^{\#}$  | B | A |  $G^{\#}$  all | [down] | to B”.

64: **S** has memo: “ad lib | after 4-3<sup>rd</sup> Pro[test]”.

70, 3.♩/3.♩, LH: **S** has notehead very low on G line (here, G).

70, 1.♩/4.♩, LH: **S** has crossed-out  $c^1$  (omitted here).

1d: **S** has memo (in urtext edn, m. 72): “Protest # ~~5~~ 4”.

74: **S** has memos “after Protest #3” and “Allright Ladies (m & f), I’ll play the ~~snake~~ rock line | ie sky line West Rock Mt. | again | and harmonize it nice & proper, the nice ways you do likes—though it would go [with] surely the S’s very well! Rollo! But this nice section, Rollo, almost any nice | Prof. of Mus, even Walter Damrousch, Josy Hoffman Toss the ninny | Madam Cuckoo, & almost all celebrated opera singers or | perhaps even all the Phila conductors, could know & play these | nice sounds”, and tempo “Adagio or Allegro or Varied Air & Variations, very nice!”

77, 4.♩/1.♩, RH/downstem: **S** has  $e^{\flat 1}$  apparently superceded by  $f^1$  (as here).

78, 3.♩, LH/downstem: **S** has a mostly erased flat (omitted here).

78, 4.♩/1.♩, RH: **S** has note head sitting low in A space, partly overlapping G line (here,  $a^1$ ).

81, 5.♩, LH/downstem: **S** has mostly erased  $d$  (omitted here).

81, last ♪, RH: **S** has mostly erased  $b\sharp^1$  (omitted here).

87, last ♪, LH: **S** has what appears to be a figure “3” just above the  $f$  (perhaps a misplaced attempt to cross out the upper F?).

88–90: **S**, p. [5] has memo: “to [symbol] back 2’s” (referring to the revised passage on **S**, p. [6] that is on the reverse side of **S**, p. [2]); this edition utilizes the revised passage).

89, 2. ♪/3. ♪, RH/upstem: **S** has this  $a^2+c^2$  crossed out (here, in parentheses).

91: **S**, p. [3] has “(con expression)” (as used here).

94: **S** has memos: “but G.A.D. [i.e. Grit And Dagger] gets mad at th[em] | again—he ought to be polite for | he will not be engaged | & paid at the next | nice afternoon ~~TEA~~ concert!” and “starts to throw things at them”. At the end of m. 80 **S**, p. [5] has memo: “DC | at [symbol]” referring to p. [1] whose passage is replaced by **S**, p. [2] (the latter as used here).

## Waltz-Rondo, s. 125

### DESCRIPTION OF SOURCES

**S** Pencil sketch, on 5 single leaves of 12-stave paper, all previously used for *Symphony No. 2* parts; headed: “Waltz-Rondo”.

p. 1 (f4828) mm. 1–37 (reverse = *Symphony No. 2*/iii, Trbn1&2); mm. 1–24 crossed out

p. 2 (f4829) mm. 38–63 (reverse = *Symphony No. 2*/iii, Vn2); memo in RH margin: “see complete copy for | A. B. D. F. – with measures | for 2<sup>nd</sup>-string player | (end of score book -A | on bench)” (referring to the boxed letters, A–F) [missing source]

p. 3 (f4830) mm. 64–85 (reverse = *Symphony No. 2*/iii, Va); memo above m. 78: “(see complete | ink copy 4 sts [staves?])” [missing source]

p. 4 (f4831) mm. 86–113 (reverse = *Symphony No. 2*/iii, Cello); memo after rej. m. 93: “see back p 2–3 | long score Sym #2.” [missing score]

p. 5 (f4832) mm. 114–142 (reverse = *Symphony No. 2*/iii, DB); memos at end: “Finit – In the the | Little House | at Hartsdale not Arlington” and “see better copy for last 14 meas. Coda | in ink on attached sheet” [unknown source]

### CRITICAL COMMENTARY

3, 4–6. ♪, RH: **S** has the tied C crossed out (but retained here).

3, 3. ♪, RH: **S** has notehead sitting high in C space (here,  $c^2$ ).

4, 3. ♪, RH/downstem: **S** has notehead sitting high on F line (here,  $f\sharp^2$ ).

4–5: **S** lacks barline (at end of System 1; supplied here, since meter directly identifies m. 4 as  $\frac{3}{4}$  measure).

8: **S** has triangular symbol

8–10: Ives's numbering of these measures as "1 – 2 – 3" continues its sequence at m. 38.

9, 1. ♩, RH/downstem: **S** has quarter value (perhaps half is intended).

11: This meas. is vigorously marked out on **S**.

15, 2. ♩, RH/downstem: While **S** could be interpreted to have  $g+d^1$ , it appears that Ives's intention (with a single bold ledger line) is to have  $b+d^1$  (as here).

16, 1. ♩, RH/downstem: While **S** could be interpreted to have  $f^{\sharp}+c^1$ , it appears that Ives's intention is to have  $a^{\sharp}+c^1$  (as here).

36, 5. ♩, RH: **S** has flat sitting in C space (here, for  $b^1$ ) and flat sitting in E space (here, for  $d^2$ ).

39, RH: On **S** Ives marks this bar "D" (as realized here with a two-sharps signature).

40, RH: On **S** Ives marks this bar "D $\flat$ " (as realized here with a five-flats signature).

40, 3. ♩/1. ♩, RH: **S** has notehead sitting low in F space, partially on E line (here,  $e^{\sharp 1}$ ).

41, RH: On **S** Ives marks this bar "D" (as realized here with a two-sharps signature).

42, RH: On **S** Ives marks this bar "D $\flat$ " (as realized here with a five-flats signature).

42, 2. ♩/2. ♩, LH: **S** has notehead sitting high in G space, partially on A line (here,  $a$ ).

42, 3. ♩/2. ♩, LH: **S** has notehead sitting high on A line (here,  $b$ ).

43: On **S** Ives appears to have indicated each staff as "C" (i.e. C major, no key signature), but then added "D" above treble staff (as realized here with a two-sharps signature).

44: On **S** Ives at first labeled each staff "D $\sharp$ ", then both altered to "D $\flat$ " (as realized here with five-flats signatures each).

44, last ♩, RH: **S** has crossed out  $d(\flat)^1$  (omitted here).

46, RH: On **S** Ives marks this bar "D" (as realized here with a two-sharps signature).

46, 4. , LH: **S** has  $\flat$  for  $c^1$  (probably meant as  $cb^1$ ) and  $\flat$  for  $B$  (probably meant as  $B^{\flat\flat}$ ).

47, RH: On **S** Ives marks this bar “ $D\flat$ ” (as realized here with a five-flats signature).

47, LH: On **S** Ives marks this bar “ $D\sharp$ ” (as realized here with a two-sharps signature).

47, 3. /3-4. , RH: **S** has  $b\sharp^1-d\sharp^2$  for upper pitches (but this passage imitates m. 45 LH, down m2, thus these pitches should be  $b\flat^1-d\flat^2$ , as here editorially).

48, RH: On **S** Ives marks this bar “ $D\sharp$ ” (as realized here with a two-sharps signature).

49: At the end of m. 49 **S** has a symbol referring back to m. 8.

8a–10a + 38a–42a = 1<sup>st</sup> repetition of mm. 8–10 “Main Theme”.

12a–24a = direct reuse of mm. 12–24.

8b–10b + 38b–42b = 2<sup>nd</sup> reuse of mm. 8–10 “Main Theme”.

25a–29a + 31a–32a = direct reuse of mm. 25–29 + 31–32.

30: **S** has this labeled “II” (i.e. 2<sup>nd</sup> ending).

37: At the end of m. 37 **S** has a symbol referring back to m. 8.

8c–10c + 38c–42c = 3<sup>rd</sup> reuse of mm. 8–10 “Main Theme”.

50a–55a = direct reuse of mm. 50–55 (which are successively marked “a – b – c – d – e – f”).

56: **S** encodes this measure (“as b”) to be the 2<sup>nd</sup> reuse of m. 51.

57: **S** encodes this measure (“as d”) to be the 2<sup>nd</sup> reuse of m. 53.

59: At the end of m. 59 **S** has a sign referring back to m. 8.

8d–10d + 38d–42d = 4<sup>th</sup> reuse of mm. 8–10 “Main Theme”.

60a–62a = direct reuse of mm. 60–62 (m. 63 is marked “I” for a 1<sup>st</sup> ending; m. 64 is marked “II”).

69, last , LH: **S** has mostly erased  $C\sharp$  (omitted here).

70: This meas. of some sparse notes is vigorously marked out on **S**.

74: At the end of m. 74 **S** has a sign referring back to m. 8.

8e–10e + 38e–42e = 5<sup>th</sup> reuse of mm. 8–10 “Main Theme”.

75: **S** has memos: “If played very fast[,], another player may | take the lower staff – for | fast octaves etc | also in other places as well” and “(see complete | ink copy 4 st[ave]s”.

75–88, LH: Ives employs borrowing from “Columbia, the Gem of the Ocean”.

77–82, RH: Ives employs borrowing from “Turkey in the Straw”.

82–84, RH: Ives employs borrowing from “Sailor’s Hornpipe”.

8e–10e + 38e–42e = 5<sup>th</sup> reuse of mm. 8–10 “Main Theme”.

84: This meas. is vigorously marked out on **S**.

86–87, RH: Ives employs borrowing from “The White Cockade”.

88: At the end of m. 88 **S** has a sign referring back to m. 8 (but see following note).

89–92: Ives appears to map a plan for a possible return to mm. 8–10 + 38–42 to be followed by sections A–F without the interruption of the “Main Theme” (“(a) to [symbol] p. 1 [then] A B C D E F to Coda | or | (b) or to Coda”), but the “or to Coda” seems to override that plan with an arrow going directly to m. 94.

101, 3.♩, LH/downstem: **S** has notehead smudging across both the E space and D line, but the *b* is clearly on the *e* (here, *eb* only).

106: This measure is m. 14 with the staves swapped, but note the change (perhaps mistaken) of the LH’s 2<sup>nd</sup> & 3<sup>rd</sup> eighths.

123, 2.♩/2.♩, RH: Ives may have intended to sustain his pattern of minor thirds, thus *b<sup>h</sup>2* may be a proper correction.

123, end: **S** has memo: “to [symbol] | back | p. 4” (but no such symbol appears on p. 4, front or back).

124–34, LH: Ives employs borrowing from “Columbia, the Gem of the Ocean”.

129–30, RH: Ives employs borrowing from “Fisher’s Hornpipe”.

130–32, RH: Ives employs borrowing from “Turkey in the Straw”.

132–33, RH: Ives employs borrowing from “Sailor’s Hornpipe”.

132–33, LH: Ives employs borrowing from “Marching Through Georgia”.

138: On **S** Ives crossed out this meas.

140–42: After the concluding m. 139, **S** has several measures of a “Nicer CoDa” marked out.

# The “St. Gaudens” (Black March), s. 683iii

## DESCRIPTION OF SOURCE

**S** Ink score, on 16-stave paper, with copious pencil markings toward Version 1 (1916) of *Orchestral Set No. 1: Three Places in New England* (S. 7), mvt. 1 (“The ‘St. Gaudens’ in Boston Common”); p. 1 headed: “C. E. IVES ~~Hartsdale NY PO: 82~~ | to 37 Liberty St., NY 3660 John” [all crossed out]; generally lacking dynamic and tempo markings (here, supplied editorially based on Ives’s subsequent use of the material); the wide spacing between systems and the large, preplanned gap between beats 223 and 224 suggest that Ives was planning to use this ink mapping out of his “Black March” as a score-sketch for the orchestral movement (Version 1).

pp. 1–6 (f1014–19) 279 quarter beats, unbarred (68 mm. in ink, using Ives’s penciled barlines)

## CRITICAL COMMENTARY

This edition is based on the ink of **S**. All square-bracketed material is imported from Ives’s markings in Version 1 of the orchestral version; cue-sized markings appear usefully in pencil in **S**.

Citation is by quarter beats.

2, LH: **S** has penciled natural sign on *d* (included here cue-sized as a clarification, rather than a later change).

25, 2.♩, RH: **S** has penciled natural sign on *b*<sup>1</sup> (included here cue-sized as a clarification, rather than a later change).

63, last ♯: **S** has this arpeggio expressed in 32<sup>nd</sup> notes (here, as a nonuplet of 128<sup>th</sup> notes).

71, RH: **S** has penciled natural sign on *d*<sup>2</sup> (included here cue-sized as a clarification, rather than a later change).

76, LH/down stem: **S** pencil has the tie and *C* (included here cue-sized as a completion of the inked pattern).

95, RH: **S** has penciled natural sign on *g*<sup>2</sup> (included here cue-sized as a clarification, rather than a later change).

111, RH: **S** has dotted half notes with pencil crossing out of value dots and filling in of the open noteheads (an inked chord is added on 112; here, the intended alteration is realized).

111, LH: **S** has ink alteration of whole bar into a quintuplet (here, only the original version).

113: **S** has penciled “a little faster” (as included here).

133: **S** has penciled *EE* half note (included here cue-sized to continue the inked pattern).

136, 1.♪, RH: **S** has penciled “piu | rit” (included here in its later version “poco ten.”).

155, 2.♪, RH: **S** has penciled “a little faster (or with a kind of springy way)” (as included here).

177, 1.♪, LH/downstem: **S** has half note (here, dotted half).

186: **S** has ink “Slowly [or ‘slower’?] and firmly (broadly)” (slightly edited here).

190, 1.♪, RH: **S** has whole notes (here, half notes).

194, LH: **S** had *f*, but scratched out and replace by *c* (as here).

199–203/down stems. LH: **S** has only the upper octave, with “oct.” below (octaves realized here).

204, RH/upstem: **S** has penciled natural sign on  $e^2$  (included here cue-sized as a clarification, rather than a later change).

209–210, LH/downstems: **S** has natural signs in upper octave only (lower octave naturals added editorially).

210, LH/upstem: It is not clear what accidental the *g* first had, if any, however there are three pencil confirmations of ♯ (as used here, in cue-size).

219, RH: **S** has penciled  $c^3 + e^3 + g^3$  (included here cue-sized to sustain the texture).

220–22: **S** originally appears to have had evenly placed LH eighths and sixteenth-displaced RH eighths (as here); at some point later, perhaps in preparation for the orchestral version, Ives added in ink 32<sup>nd</sup> flags to RH 220 & 221, 2.♪ each and to LH 222, 2.♪ (all of the ink is crossed out in pencil and multiply revised in mixed pencil and ink).

223–224: Ives leaves a large special gap between these beats as if he anticipated recomposing the end of the denouement in 219–223.

228, RH: **S** seems to only inadvertently lacking  $f^{\#1}$  (added here editorially; it appears in all later orchestral versions).

240: On **S** Ives added in blue pencil “slower” (as included here).

244, RH: **S** has half note chord (omitted here) duplicating the pitches of the dotted half (perhaps mistakenly anticipating the notation on 248).

250, RH: **S** has penciled sharp sign on  $g^1$  (included here cue-sized as a clarification, rather than a later change).

259, LH: **S** has penciled natural sign on  $c$  (included here cue-sized as a clarification, rather than a later change).