

## Charles Ives: Study No. 21: Some South-Paw Pitching!!, S. 105

### DESCRIPTION OF SOURCES

- S** Pencil sketch (c1918–19), on 16-stave leaf (torn from the 2<sup>nd</sup> ink copy of mvt. 1 of *Sonata No. 1 for Piano*), headed: “‘Some ‘South Paw Pitching!’ | ‘and to toughen up the [line up to “Paw”]’”. pp. 1–2 (f4814–15) complete; top margin trimmed away
- M** Ink score (c1922–23) with pencil addenda, upside down on 12-stave, piano-braced paper; headed in pencil “#21” (boxed).  
p. 5 (f4812) mm. 1–13 (on p. 10 of the ink copy of mvt. 2 of *Sonata No. 3 for Violin and Piano*; sharing the page with the rejected end of *Study No. 20*, ink score)  
p. 6–7 (f4816–17) mm. 14–41 (on former pp. 18–19 of ink copy of mvt. 1 or *Sonata No. 3 for Violin and Piano*; p. 7 shares with the beginning off *Study No. 22*, ink score)
- P** Edition edited by Henry Cowell, under the title “Some South-Paw Pitching”, published by Mercury Music Corporation (New York, 1949).  
pp. 3–7 (—) complete (Cowell’s edition appears to be taken exclusively from **S**. Ives apparently gave Cowell a marked up set of photostat copies after failing to locate **M**. There are numerous differences from **S**; most of them are likely Cowell’s errors of reading Ives’s manuscripts and some errors introduced in the engraving process, but some appear to be Ives’s own changes—as noted below.)

### CRITICAL COMMENTARY

This urtext edition uses **M** as the principal source. Selective references below to **SP** highlight differences that may be of use in correcting or elucidating **M**.

1, Tempo: **M** has “Adagio meastoso” (here, corrected to “maestoso”).


1, 5. ♩/4<sup>th</sup> triplet ♩, RH/upstem: **S** has # for  $c^2$  (as here) lacking in **M**.


1, 5. ♩/3<sup>rd</sup> triplet ♩, RH/downstem: **P** has triplet eighth  $f\sharp^1 + a\sharp^1$  (possibly an addition made by Ives on photostats).


1, 6. ♩, RH/downstem: **S** has quarter  $f\sharp^1 + a\sharp^1$  (as here) lacking in **M**.


1, 8. ♩, RH/downstem: **M** has  $b$  for  $g^1$  changed to  $b$  (as here).






1, after 8. ♩: **M** has pre-printed barline (end of system; though on some other systems Ives marked out these pre-printed barlines, ignored here).


1, 8–10. : **P** has a revision in these three beats.


1, last , LH/upstem: **M** has small *a* notehead seemingly overwritten by *b*; **S** has *b* (as here).


2, Tempo: **S** has “Allegretto quasi andante | 40 or | 50 | ~~60~~+ [=] .


3, 2. , RH/downstem: **SP** additionally have *f*<sup>1</sup> (which is scratched off on **M**, and omitted here).

3, 3. –4. , RH/downstems: **M** had *d*<sup>1</sup>–*d*<sup>1</sup> tied, then the tie and latter *d* scratched out, with 3.  overwritten by tied-back *e*<sup>1</sup> (as here), and 4.  replaced by *f*<sup>1</sup> (as here). **P** has *d*<sup>1</sup> on 3. .


3, 7. , LH/downstem: **S** has a crossed-out half note *C* not appearing in **M** (but used in **P**).

3, 9. , RH: **SP** have quarter notes *f*<sup>1</sup> + *b*<sup>1</sup> (as here) lacking in **M**.

3, 9. , LH: **S** additionally has a crossed-out whole note *F* not appearing in **M** (but used in **P**).


3, 14. , RH: **M** has  $\natural$  sign on F line (here, for *g*<sup>2</sup>).


3, end: **M** has memo referring to “p. 5” but this must mean p. 7 of the source.



4–5, LH: **P** appears to use an Ives patch intended for mm. 40–41, 2. , LH.

9 & 10: Between mm. 9 & 10 **M** has a heavily marked out material (possibly 4 sixteenths’ worth).

10, 2. –12: **P** has reordered & recomposed material.

11, 3. , LH: **S** has  $\flat$  for tied-forward *g* (**M** has  $\natural$ , as here).

12, 1–2. : **P** has revision possibly dictated by Ives.

13: **S** has memo: “faster so that  of | new [triplet eighth figure] = | of the  of [four sixteenths figure]”.

14, 2.♩/1<sup>st</sup> triplet ♩, LH/upstem: **SMP** have ♮ for *g* (as here, where *b* would seem logical).

17, 4.♩/last triplet ♩, RH: **P** additionally has *f*<sup>2</sup> not found in **SM**.

18, 1.♩, RH: **P** has *b* for 1.♩ *b*<sup>2</sup> and *#* for 2.♩ *c*<sup>3</sup> (apparently misreadings of **S**).

18, 4.♩, RH: **P** has 1.♩ additional *a*<sup>2</sup>+*b*<sup>2</sup> and 3.♩ additional *d*<sup>3</sup> not found in **SM**.

21, 4.♩, RH: **P** has this chord only on the last eighth (possibly a revision dictated by Ives).

21(4.♩)–22: **S** has cresc. wedge above RH staff, and memo “(L.H. non decres” below LH staff.

22, 3.♩/3<sup>rd</sup> triplet ♩, LH/upstem: **S** has *#* for *f* (as here) lacking in **M**.

25, 4.♩/2.♩, RH: **S** has *b* for *e*<sup>1</sup> (as here) lacking in **M**.

25, 4.♩/3.♩, LH: **S** has *c*<sup>#1</sup> (as here) lacking in **M**.

26, 3.♩/1.♩, LH: **SM** have top pitch *e*<sup>1</sup> (as here); **P** has *g*<sup>1</sup>.

28, 4.♩, LH: **S** has *#* for *f* (as here) lacking in **M**.


28, 4.♩/4.♩, RH: **SM** have no accidental for *c*<sup>2</sup> (here, editorial ♮); **P** has *#*.



29, 3.♩: **SP** have “quasi Presto” not appearing in **M**.

30, 1.♩, RH: **M** has ♮ for *d*<sup>1</sup> (as here); **S** has no accidental; **P** has *b* (perhaps Ives’s correction?).

31, 4.♩/4.♩, RH/upstem: **SM** have no accidental for *d*<sup>2</sup> (here, editorial ♮); **P** has *#*.


32: **S** has “Allegro modo–” not appearing in **M**.

32, last , RH: **M** has small notehead  $c^2$  (presumably a mistake) with larger notehead  $b^1$ ; **S** has only the  $b^1$  (as here); **P** has eighth rest.



33, 3. <sup>1st</sup> triplet , LH/upstem: **SM** have  $g$  (as here); **P** has  $G$ .



35, 3. <sup>3rd</sup> triplet , LH/upstem: **P** additionally has  $f$  not in **SM**.



36, 3. <sup>3rd</sup> triplet , LH/upstem: **P** additionally has  $d^1$  not in **SM**.

37, 1. , RH: **S** has  $b$  for  $g^2$  (as here) lacking in **M**.

37, 1. , LH/downstem: **S** has triplet bracket (as here) lacking in **M**.

37, 2. <sup>3rd</sup> triplet , LH/upstem: **SM** have  $\natural$  for  $g$  (as here); **P** has  $\sharp$ .





37, 3. <sup>1st</sup> triplet , LH/upstem: **M** has possibly two noteheads mashed together  $a+b$  (very thick downstem,  $\natural$  seemingly for  $b$ ); **S** has just  $a\natural$  (as here).


38, 3. <sup>2nd</sup> , RH/upstem: **S** has no accidental for  $d^2$ ; **M** has  $\natural$  (as here); **P** has  $b$ .

38, 3. <sup>3rd</sup> triplet , LH/upstem: **M** appears to have had  $b^b$  but this is boldly overwritten by an  $a^\sharp$  (as here).

39 = m. 3

40: On **M** Ives changed his “agiganta” to “agiganto” (as here) and his “hitopa” to “hitopo” (as here).

40–41, LH: **P** seems to use an Ives patch that violates the chromatic sequencing of the figure in **SM**; at the 5<sup>th</sup> septuplet  of each the following beats Cowell has at m. 40, 1&3.   $g$ , 4.   $a\natural$ , and at m. 41, 1.   $a$ . This edition follows **M**.

41, after 4. : **M** has a mostly erased barline (omitted here).

41, last half rest: **S** has memo: “after a 2<sup>nd</sup> thought | look for [a] boy | in front Row!”.

41, last fermata: **S** ends with a sad-face figure, **M** with an alternation of the fermata into a happy-face figure.