

Charles Ives: Study No. 21: Some South-Paw Pitching!!, S. 105

DESCRIPTION OF SOURCES

- S** Pencil sketch (c1918–19), on 16-stave leaf (torn from the 2nd ink copy of mvt. 1 of *Sonata No. 1 for Piano*), headed: “‘Some ‘South Paw Pitching!’ | ‘and to toughen up the [line up to “Paw”]’”. pp. 1–2 (f4814–15) complete; top margin trimmed away
- M** Ink score (c1922–23) with pencil addenda, upside down on 12-stave, piano-braced paper; headed in pencil “#21” (boxed).
p. 5 (f4812) mm. 1–13 (on p. 10 of the ink copy of mvt. 2 of *Sonata No. 3 for Violin and Piano*; sharing the page with the rejected end of *Study No. 20*, ink score)
p. 6–7 (f4816–17) mm. 14–41 (on former pp. 18–19 of ink copy of mvt. 1 or *Sonata No. 3 for Violin and Piano*; p. 7 shares with the beginning off *Study No. 22*, ink score)
- P** Edition edited by Henry Cowell, under the title “Some South-Paw Pitching”, published by Mercury Music Corporation (New York, 1949).
pp. 3–7 (—) complete (Cowell’s edition appears to be taken exclusively from **S**. Ives apparently gave Cowell a marked up set of photostat copies after failing to locate **M**. There are numerous differences from **S**; most of them are likely Cowell’s errors of reading Ives’s manuscripts and some errors introduced in the engraving process, but some appear to be Ives’s own changes—as noted below.)

CRITICAL COMMENTARY

This urtext edition uses **M** as the principal source. Selective references below to **SP** highlight differences that may be of use in correcting or elucidating **M**.

1, Tempo: **M** has “Adagio meastoso” (here, corrected to “maestoso”).

1, 5. ♩/4th triplet ♩, RH/upstem: **S** has # for c^2 (as here) lacking in **M**.

1, 5. ♩/3rd triplet ♩, RH/downstem: **P** has triplet eighth $f\#^1 + a\#^1$ (possibly an addition made by Ives on photostats).

1, 6. ♩, RH/downstem: **S** has quarter $f\#^1 + a\#^1$ (as here) lacking in **M**.

1, 8. ♩, RH/downstem: **M** has b for g^1 changed to b (as here).

1, after 8. ♩: **M** has pre-printed barline (end of system; though on some other systems Ives marked out these pre-printed barlines, ignored here).

1, 8–10. : **P** has a revision in these three beats.

1, last , LH/upstem: **M** has small *a* notehead seemingly overwritten by *b*; **S** has *b* (as here).

2, Tempo: **S** has “Allegretto quasi andante | 40 or | 50 | ~~60~~+ [=] .

3, 2. , RH/downstem: **SP** additionally have *f*¹ (which is scratched off on **M**, and omitted here).

3, 3. –4. , RH/downstems: **M** had *d*¹–*d*¹ tied, then the tie and latter *d* scratched out, with 3.  overwritten by tied-back *e*¹ (as here), and 4.  replaced by *f*¹ (as here). **P** has *d*¹ on 3. .

3, 7. , LH/downstem: **S** has a crossed-out half note *C* not appearing in **M** (but used in **P**).

3, 9. , RH: **SP** have quarter notes *f*¹ + *b*¹ (as here) lacking in **M**.

3, 9. , LH: **S** additionally has a crossed-out whole note *F* not appearing in **M** (but used in **P**).

3, 14. , RH: **M** has \natural sign on F line (here, for *g*²).

3, end: **M** has memo referring to “p. 5” but this must mean p. 7 of the source.

4–5, LH: **P** appears to use an Ives patch intended for mm. 40–41, 2. , LH.

9 & 10: Between mm. 9 & 10 **M** has a heavily marked out material (possibly 4 sixteenths’ worth).

10, 2. –12: **P** has reordered & recomposed material.

11, 3. , LH: **S** has \flat for tied-forward *g* (**M** has \natural , as here).

12, 1–2. : **P** has revision possibly dictated by Ives.

13: **S** has memo: “faster so that  of | new [triplet eighth figure] = | of the  of [four sixteenths figure]”.

14, 2.♩/1st triplet ♩, LH/upstem: **SMP** have ♮ for *g* (as here, where *b* would seem logical).

17, 4.♩/last triplet ♩, RH: **P** additionally has *f*² not found in **SM**.

18, 1.♩, RH: **P** has *b* for 1.♩ *b*² and *#* for 2.♩ *c*³ (apparently misreadings of **S**).

18, 4.♩, RH: **P** has 1.♩ additional *a*²+*b*² and 3.♩ additional *d*³ not found in **SM**.

21, 4.♩, RH: **P** has this chord only on the last eighth (possibly a revision dictated by Ives).

21(4.♩)–22: **S** has cresc. wedge above RH staff, and memo “(L.H. non decres” below LH staff.

22, 3.♩/3rd triplet ♩, LH/upstem: **S** has *#* for *f* (as here) lacking in **M**.

25, 4.♩/2.♩, RH: **S** has *b* for *e*¹ (as here) lacking in **M**.

25, 4.♩/3.♩, LH: **S** has *c*^{#1} (as here) lacking in **M**.

26, 3.♩/1.♩, LH: **SM** have top pitch *e*¹ (as here); **P** has *g*¹.

28, 4.♩, LH: **S** has *#* for *f* (as here) lacking in **M**.

28, 4.♩/4.♩, RH: **SM** have no accidental for *c*² (here, editorial ♮); **P** has *#*.

29, 3.♩: **SP** have “quasi Presto” not appearing in **M**.

30, 1.♩, RH: **M** has ♮ for *d*¹ (as here); **S** has no accidental; **P** has *b* (perhaps Ives’s correction?).

31, 4.♩/4.♩, RH/upstem: **SM** have no accidental for *d*² (here, editorial ♮); **P** has *#*.

32: **S** has “Allegro modo–” not appearing in **M**.

32, last , RH: **M** has small notehead c^2 (presumably a mistake) with larger notehead b^1 ; **S** has only the b^1 (as here); **P** has eighth rest.

33, 3.  1st triplet , LH/upstem: **SM** have g (as here); **P** has G .

35, 3.  3rd triplet , LH/upstem: **P** additionally has f not in **SM**.

36, 3.  3rd triplet , LH/upstem: **P** additionally has d^1 not in **SM**.

37, 1. , RH: **S** has b for g^2 (as here) lacking in **M**.

37, 1. , LH/downstem: **S** has triplet bracket (as here) lacking in **M**.

37, 2.  3rd triplet , LH/upstem: **SM** have \natural for g (as here); **P** has \sharp .

37, 3.  1st triplet , LH/upstem: **M** has possibly two noteheads mashed together $a+b$ (very thick downstem, \natural seemingly for b); **S** has just $a\natural$ (as here).

38, 3.  2. , RH/upstem: **S** has no accidental for d^2 ; **M** has \natural (as here); **P** has b .

38, 3.  3rd triplet , LH/upstem: **M** appears to have had b^b but this is boldly overwritten by an a^\sharp (as here).

39 = m. 3

40: On **M** Ives changed his “agiganta” to “agiganto” (as here) and his “hitopa” to “hitopo” (as here).

40–41, LH: **P** seems to use an Ives patch that violates the chromatic sequencing of the figure in **SM**; at the 5th septuplet  of each the following beats Cowell has at m. 40, 1&3.  g , 4.  $a\natural$, and at m. 41, 1.  a . This edition follows **M**.

41, after 4. : **M** has a mostly erased barline (omitted here).

41, last half rest: **S** has memo: “after a 2nd thought | look for [a] boy | in front Row!”.

41, last fermata: **S** ends with a sad-face figure, **M** with an alternation of the fermata into a happy-face figure.